

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Biographical Notes</i>	xi

Introduction: The Legacy of Maurice Halbwachs	1
SUSANNE KARSTEDT	

Part I: ‘The Truth and Nothing but the Truth’: Truth and Justice between the Past and the Present

1. Unspeakable Memories and Commensurable Laws.....	27
STANLEY COHEN	
2. An Emerging ‘Right to Truth’: Latin-American Contributions	39
JUAN E MENDEZ	

Part II: Divided Memories, Contested Truths, Silenced Voices

3. Reflections on Law and Memory	63
EMILIOS CHRISTODOULIDIS AND SCOTT VEITCH	
4. Divided Memories: How Emerging Democracies Deal with the Crimes of Previous Regimes	79
HERIBERT ADAM	
5. Common Past, Divided Truth: The Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South African Public Opinion.....	101
GUNNAR THEISSEN	
6. From Silence to Testimony: The Role of Legal Institutions in the Restoration of the Collective Memories of Korean ‘Comfort Women’	135
YOUNG-HEE SHIM	

Part III: Law, Memory and the Politics of Culture and Identity

7. Negotiating the Past: Culture Industry and the Law	161
HEINZ STEINERT	
8. Australia’s Sorry Judges: Nationalism and Collective Memory	187
KATHY LASTER	
9. Experienced Authenticity of Culture and Legal Liberties	217
ARTHUR L STINCHCOMBE	

**Part IV: Creating and Restituting Rights after Abusive Regimes:
Bridges between the Past and the Future**

10. Constitutional Interpretation after Regimes of Horror..... 233
KIM LANE SCHEPPELE
11. Paying for Past Injustices and Creating New Ones:
On Property Rights Restitution in Poland as an Element
of the Unfinished Transformation 259
GRAŻYNA SKĄPSKA

**Part V: The Stores of Memory:
Files, Individual Biographies and Collective Memories**

12. Biographies, Legal Cases and Political Transitions 283
CAROL A HEIMER AND ARTHUR L STINCHCOMBE
13. Biographies and Résumés as Part of Life under
Communist Rule in the Czech Republic..... 317
JÍŘINA ŠIKLOVÁ
14. The ‘Stasi Records’, the Public and Collective Memories:
The Inspection of Personal Records 329
ROGER ENGELMANN
15. The Art of Forgetting: The Communist Police State
as a Non-reality..... 341
ANDRZEJ ZYBERTOWICZ

Part VI: Failing Memory: The Law and its Past

16. The Loss of Early Women Lawyers from Collective Memory
in Germany: A Memoir of Magdalene Schoch 355
KONSTANZE PLETT
17. Putting the Nazi Past Behind: Juvenile Justice and Germany’s
Changing Political Culture 373
RUTH G HERZ

- Index*..... 391

Acknowledgements

The contributions to this collection were first presented in a workshop entitled 'Legal Institutions and Collective Memories' at the International Institute for the Sociology of Law in Oñati, Spain in 1999. The workshop was supported by the Institute and a generous grant from the Volkswagen Foundation, Germany, as part of their Programme 'Recht und Verhalten' (Law and Behaviour). The Volkswagen Foundation gave further financial support to the publication of this volume. I wish to express my gratitude to both institutions, in particular to Malen Gordoia from the International Institute in Oñati, whose support in organising the workshop was invaluable, and to Dr Hagen Hof from the Volkswagen Foundation, for his encouragement, advice and support throughout the project. I owe a great debt of gratitude to the authors not only for their wonderful contributions but for their patience with the editor. Kirsten Lieps, Nadine Bals and Lena Kruckenberg from the University of Bielefeld helped with the editorial work, and I am grateful to these wonderful young women. A Visiting Fellowship at the Regulatory Institutions Network at the Australian National University and a visit to Oñati finally allowed for the time to put everything together. I wish to thank my colleagues at RegNet for their inspiring ideas, the Australian National University for financial support and the International Institute of the Sociology of Law for a wonderful office.

Susanne Karstedt
Keele University
United Kingdom

Biographical Notes

Maurice Halbwachs (1877–1945) was the first to coin the term and conceptualise the notion of ‘collective memory’. As a student and collaborator of Emile Durkheim on the ‘L’Année Sociologique’ since 1905, his debts to this teacher can be traced throughout his work. Nonetheless, his work on collective memory, though perhaps the most Durkheimian in spirit and in method, is also the most independent from the master as well as the other disciples, who were friends and collaborators. He started his lifelong engagement with the topic as early as 1925 with ‘Les Cadres sociaux de la mémoire’ (Paris, Alcan, 1925; translated into English as *On Collective Memory*, with an introduction by Lewis A Coser (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1992)). He combined his interests in both social morphology and the imprint of social life into social space, and collective memory in his 1941 study on the legends from a book of gospels from rural France (*La Topographie légendaire des Évangiles en Terre Sainte, étude du mémoire collective* (Paris, Presses universitaires de France, 1941). His exploration of the spatial organisation of social life also shaped his last (unfinished) work on collective memory, *La Mémoire collective* that was posthumously published by his sister (Paris, Presses Universitaires de France, 1950; translated into English as *The Collective Memory*, with an introduction by Mary Douglas (New York, Harper, 1950)). The amazing diversity of his work and research is characterised by a continuous engagement with what he saw as ‘collective psychology’ and the material conditions of social life. Collective psychology, at the core of which is his work on collective memory, is the science of the representation of material conditions in social life, and simultaneously the science of the representation of social life in the individual. His last book on collective memory testifies to this, starting with a chapter on individual memory and dreams, and finishing with a chapter on social space and memory. In 1919, Maurice Halbwachs became Professor of Sociology at the University of Strasbourg. From 1935 to 1944 he held a Chair in Sociology at the Sorbonne. In 1944 he was awarded a Chair in Collective Psychology; but only a month later, he was arrested by the Gestapo and deported to the concentration camp Buchenwald in Germany. He was murdered there in March 1945, only days before the Allies liberated the camp.

Heribert Adam is Professor Emeritus of Sociology and Anthropology at Simon Fraser University, Canada. He won international recognition for his comparative work on transitional justice, politics of memory and Truth and

Reconciliation Commissions. In 2000, he was elected Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada. In 1998 he was awarded with the Konrad Adenauer Research Prize, and he received the Outstanding Contribution Award of the Canadian Sociology and Anthropology Association. He was President of the International Sociological Association's Research Committee on Ethnic, Minority and Race Relations. He has published widely on transitional justice in South Africa and Germany, and in his most recent book, *Seeking Mandela: Peacemaking between Israelis and Palestinians* (with K Moodley, 2005) he takes his expertise to a new area.

Emilios Christodoulidis is Professor of Legal Theory at the University of Glasgow. Prior to that he taught at the University of Edinburgh. His area of research and publishing comprises philosophy and sociology of law, and constitutional theory. He has authored numerous articles on these subjects, and his book *Law and Reflexive Politics* won the European Award for Legal Theory in 1996 and the 1998 SPTL Prize for Outstanding Legal Scholarship. He was visiting Professor at the European Academy for Legal Theory in Brussels and gave the Kobe Lectures in Japan in 2002. Together with Scott Veitch he edited a book entitled *Lethe's Law: Justice, Law and Ethics in Reconciliation* (2001) and has published in particular on the South-African TRC. His most recent book (together with Scott Veitch) is on jurisprudence.

Stanley Cohen is Professor Emeritus of Sociology at the London School of Economics and a member of the Mannheim Centre of Criminology. In 1987, he was elected to the British Academy and is currently on the Board of the International Council on Human Rights. He has published groundbreaking work in criminology, of which he is presently preparing new editions. His book, *States of Denial: Knowing About Atrocities and Suffering* (2001), for which he won the 2002 British Academy Book Prize, deals with public reactions to information, images and appeals about inhumanities. His current work includes follow-up research to *States of Denial*; a study of how Truth Commissions create collective memory; and an international project on 'crime, order and security' as a human rights problem.

Roger Engelmann is Research Fellow and Senior Manager in the Department for Education and Research at the Agency of the Federal Commissioner for Documents of the Secret Service of the former German Democratic Republic. He trained as a historian, and his areas of research and publication comprise the work of the secret service during the 1950s; political prosecution and trials in the former GDR; and the critical edition of documents and sources. In his most recent work he analyses how revolutionary and defining events like 17 June 1953 or the building of the Berlin Wall are reflected in the documents and work of the secret service at that time. His

co-authored book *Kommunismus in der Krise: Die Entstalinisierung und die Folgen. Analysen und Dokumente der BStU* was published in 2007.

Carol A Heimer is Professor and Chair of the Department of Sociology at Northwestern University and a Senior Research Fellow at the American Bar Foundation. She was previously Research Fellow at Australian National University and Fellow at the LAPA at Princeton University. Her research focuses on risk and the management of risk, which she has researched in a wide range of settings, from the insurance industry to infant intensive care units. Her recent book *For the Sake of Children* (with Lisa Staffen, 1998) won several awards, amongst them the Theory Prize from the Theory Section of the American Sociological Association and the Eliot Freidson Award from the Medical Sociology Section of the American Sociological Association. With her current research on AIDS treatment across continents she is interweaving the worlds of sociology, medicine and law, and addressing the intersection of normative systems, organisations, and trust, risk and uncertainty.

Ruth G Herz was a Presiding Judge at the Juvenile Court in Cologne. She started numerous initiatives in that position, in particular the first mediation project in Germany in the mid-1980s, for which she was awarded with the Federal Cross in 1998. From 2000 until 2005 she was the judge in a popular TV court room show 'The Juvenile Court'. She has taught at the University of Siegen and Bielefeld, at the University of Toronto and at the Law Faculty of Hebrew University in Jerusalem. She has also been a Fellow at St Anthony's College, Oxford. She has published a text book on juvenile law and numerous articles on juvenile delinquency. Her most recent book *Law Quite Personally: From the Desk of a Juvenile Judge* (in German) was published in 2006.

Susanne Karstedt is Professor of Criminology at the School for Sociology and Criminology at Keele University, UK. She was previously Visiting Fellow at the Law Programme and Regulatory Institutions Network at Australian National University. Her areas of research and publishing comprise transitional justice; democracy, crime and justice; emotions, crime and justice; and contemporary moral economies. In 2005, she was awarded the Christa-Hoffmann-Riehm Prize for contributions to German socio-legal studies, and in 2007 with the Sellin-Glueck Award from the American Society of Criminology. Her current research and most recent publications centre on cross-cultural comparisons.

Kathy Laster is Executive Director at the Institute of Public Administration Australia in Victoria. She has been Associate Professor in the Department of Law at La Trobe University, Melbourne; Executive Director of the Victoria

Law Foundation; and a barrister and solicitor of the Supreme Court of Victoria, Australia. She is a consultant to government agencies, including the Refugee Tribunal and the Review of Post-Arrival Programmes and Services. Her research interests focus on legal culture, the legal profession and multiculturalism and law. Representations of law in film and the role of the culture industry in shaping understandings of justice have been defining strands of her work. Her books, written in collaboration with various colleagues, include, *The Drama of the Courtroom: A Filmography; Law as Culture, Interpreters and the Legal System* and *Domestic Violence: Global Issues*. She is a regular contributor to public debate on immigration, multiculturalism, legal education and ethics, and Australian identity.

Juan E Mendez is President of the International Centre for Transitional Justice. In 2004, he was appointed the first UN Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide by UN Secretary General Kofi Annan. He served in this position until 31 March 2007. He was imprisoned twice in Argentina for his political and professional activities. In 1996, he became Executive Director of the Inter-American Institute of Human Rights in Costa Rica and was Professor of Law and Director of the Center for Civil and Human Rights at the University of Notre Dame, Indiana, from 1999 to 2004. He also was a member of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights of the Organization of American States, and its President in 2002. He has published widely on human rights in Latin America and transitional justice and has won several awards for his human rights activities.

Konstanze Plett is Professor of Gender Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Bremen and was previously Director of the Centre for Feminist Studies at the University of Bremen. She is a member of the Bremen Institute for German, European and International Gender, Labour and Social Welfare Law. Her research interests focus on the interaction between social and legal change, with special emphasis on civic and human rights, access to law, and the legal treatment of gender questions. In her current project she explores the construction of gender through law and the rights of the inter-sexed. She has widely published on gender and law and feminist studies in law, and her most recent publications address the history and contemporary problems of the laws of sexual self-determination, in particular for the inter-sexed.

Kim Lane Scheppele is Laurance S Rockefeller Professor of Public Affairs at the Woodrow Wilson School and the University Center for Human Values, and Director of the Program on Law and Public Affairs at Princeton University. Before joining Princeton University, she was John O'Brien Professor of Comparative Law and Sociology at the Law School of the University of Pennsylvania. She was Visiting Fellow at the Institute for Law and Policy and

Visiting Researcher at the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation in Moscow (2003) and Co-Director of the Programme on Gender and Culture at the Central European University, Budapest. Her research interests and publications are in the area of comparative constitutional law, in particular post-Soviet constitutional law, constitutional courts and judicial activism in the transition period. Her book-in-progress, *The International State of Emergency*, explores the creation of international security law through UN Security Council resolutions and examines the effect that apparent compliance with these resolutions has had on constitutional integrity.

Young-Hee Shim is Professor of Sociology at Hanyang University, Seoul and Director of the Hanyang Institute for Women. Since 1999, she has been Director of the Korean Women's Association United. She is a member of the Parole Commission and on the Board of numerous organisations for young offenders, women and crime prevention. She is particularly active in promoting the cause of the Korean comfort women and is on the Committee for Distribution of Funds of the Korea Women Foundation. Since 2002, she has been a Co-Representative for the organisation 'Women Making Peace'. Her research and published work mirror her activist role. Her most recent book (in English), *Sexual Violence and Feminism in Korea*, was published in 2002.

Jířina Šiklová is Professor Emeritus of Social Work at the Faculty of Humanities of Charles University, Prague, where she founded the Department of Social Work. She also founded the Gender Studies Center in Prague in 1991. She was a member of the Czech Helsinki Committee and a signatory of Charter 77, the document of the Czech dissidents, for which she lost her job and was harassed by the authorities. Currently, she publishes on women in Central Europe and is a regular contributor to the daily newspaper *Lidove Noviny* and a frequent guest in nationally televised political and sociological debates. In 2005, she also started an organisation for the promotion of reconciliation between Czechs and Germans who lived in Czechoslovakia during the pre-war period and actively supported the Czech government against Nazi-Germany. In 1999, she was awarded for her work by Vaclav Havel.

Grażyna Skąpska is Professor of Sociology of Law and Norms at the Department of Sociology at Jagiellonian University, Krakow. She is Vice-President of the International Institute of Sociology, the oldest international sociological association. She was Fellow at the Wissenschaftskolleg in Berlin in 2002–03 and has also been at universities in Australia and the US. Her research and numerous publications are in the area of social and economic transitions and transitional justice. Her most recent book in English is *The Moral Fabric in Contemporary Societies* (2003).

Heinz Steinert is Professor Emeritus of Sociology and Social Policy at Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University, Frankfurt. He was founder and until 2002 Director of the Institute for the Sociology of Law and Crime in Vienna. In 2000, he won the Lifetime Achievement Award of the Division of International Criminology of the American Society of Criminology. He has researched and published on a wide range of criminological and socio-legal topics. More recently, his research interests have focused on culture industry and critical theory, in particular the Frankfurt School and the work of Adorno. His recent publications include *Culture Industry* (2003), as well as books on deviancy and social control, citizenship and critical theory.

Arthur L Stinchcombe is Professor Emeritus of Sociology, Political Science and Organizational Behaviour at the Department of Sociology at Northwestern University and has a visiting appointment at the American Bar Foundation. He has authored numerous books on sociological theory and methods, the sociology of organisations and social history. His books include *The Logic of Social Research* (2005), *When Formality Works: Authority and Abstraction in Law and Organizations* (2001) and *Sugar Island Slavery in the Age of Enlightenment* (1995). His awards include the Sorokin Prize of the American Sociological Association for his book *Constructing Social Theories*, the Weber Prize of the American Sociological Association for his book *Information and Organizations*, and the Distinguished Career Prize of the American Sociological Association in 2004. In 2003, he was elected Fellow of the National Academy of Sciences. His most recent book, *The Logic of Social Research* (2005) is the sum of a life in social research. His current research centres on federalism.

Gunnar Theissen is a member of the task force on 'Police Reconstruction and Training in Afghanistan' at the Foreign Office (Auswärtiges Amt) of the Federal Republic of Germany since 2003. He has worked as an academic, academic adviser and member of staff with numerous other organisations in the area of crisis prevention and post-war reconciliation, including the Gesellschaft fuer Technische Zusammenarbeit, the Berghof Center for Constructive Conflict Management, Amnesty International and the German Institute for Human Rights. He has taught on the International Criminal Court at the Free University, Berlin. From 1996–98 he worked for the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation (CSVR), Johannesburg, on a review of public opinion surveys on the TRC in South Africa and has published widely on his results.

Scott Veitch is Professor of Jurisprudence at the School of Law at the University of Glasgow. Before joining the School of Law he taught at Macquarie University in Sydney. His research focuses on the areas of philosophy and politics of law. He has held visiting positions at the University

of Cape Town (1997), the European Academy of Legal Theory, Brussels (1999–2001), the University of Canterbury, NZ (2004) and the University of New South Wales, Sydney (2004). His book *Moral Conflict and Legal Reasoning* (1999) won the European Award for Legal Theory. His most recent books are *Jurisprudence* (with E Christodoulidis, 2007), *Law and the Politics of Reconciliation* (2007) and on Isaiah Berlin. His current research interests focus on the political economy of reconciliation and on complicity and irresponsibility.

Andrzej Zybortowicz is Associate Professor of Sociology and Director of the Institute of Sociology at Nicholas Copernicus University in Torun, Poland. He has been Visiting Fellow at Cambridge University and Visiting Research Scholar in Law at Macquarie University, Sydney. His area of research and publication is the role of the secret service and police in the communist state and after its downfall. His publications include *Between Dogma and a Research Program: In the Grip of Secret Services. The Collapse of Communism and the Post-Nomenklatura Networks* (in Polish) and *Privatizing the Police State: The Case of Poland* (with Maria Los, 2000, in English). Further English publications include a book chapter on ‘Hidden Actors, Overlooked Dimensions and Blind Intellectuals’ (2006). He has been active in a newly founded institution at the local and regional level, the Regional Social Dialogue Commissions, and has written an extensive report on their work and achievements. From July to November 2007 he was Chief Security Advisor to the Prime Minister of Poland and remains a presidential adviser. He also was an advisor for a book publication that accused Lech Walesa of collaboration with the secret Police.